# **Protocol**

# Wearable Devices and Nurses' Health: Protocol for an Integrative Review

Susan W Buchholz<sup>1\*</sup>, PhD, RN; Fabrice I Mowbray<sup>1\*</sup>, PhD, RN; Gabrielle Allman<sup>1\*</sup>; John P Verboncoeur<sup>2\*</sup>, PhD; Lauren Beam<sup>1\*</sup>, MSN, RN; Leigh Small<sup>1\*</sup>, PhD, RN

<sup>1</sup>College of Nursing, Michigan State University, East Lansing, MI, United States

<sup>2</sup>College of Engineering, Michigan State University, East Lansing, MI, United States

<sup>\*</sup>all authors contributed equally

**Corresponding Author:** Susan W Buchholz, PhD, RN College of Nursing Michigan State University

Hichigan State University 1355 Bogue Street #C284 East Lansing, MI, 48824 United States Phone: 1 2197765227 Email: <u>buchho44@msu.edu</u>

# Abstract

**Background:** Nurses comprise over half of the global health care workforce, and the nursing care they provide is critical for the global population's health. High patient volumes and increased medical complexity have increased the workload and stress of nurses. As a result, the health of nurses is often negatively impacted. Wearables are used within the health care setting to assess patient outcomes; however, efforts to synthesize the use of wearable devices focusing on nurses' health are limited.

**Objective:** The primary objective of our integrative review is to synthesize available data concerning the utility of wearable devices for evaluating or improving (or both) the health of nurses.

**Methods:** We are conducting an integrative review synthesizing data specific to wearable devices and nurses' health. The research question for this review aims to answer how wearable devices are used to evaluate health outcomes among nurses. We searched the following electronic databases from inception until July 2022: PubMed, Embase, CINAHL, Web of Science, IEEE Explore, and AS&T. Titles and abstracts were imported into Covidence software, where citations were screened and duplicates removed. Title and abstract screening has been completed; however, full-text screening has not been started. Further screening is being conducted independently and in duplicate by 2 teams of 2 reviewers each. These reviewers will extract data independently.

**Results:** Search strategies have been developed, and data were extracted from 6 databases. After the removal of duplicates, we collected 8603 studies for title and abstract screening. Two independent reviewers conducted the title and abstract review, and after resolving conflicts, 277 full-text articles are available for review to determine whether they meet the inclusion criteria.

**Conclusions:** This integrative review will provide synthesized data to inform nurses and other stakeholders about the extent of wearable device–related work done with nurses and provide direction for future research.

International Registered Report Identifier (IRRID): DERR1-10.2196/48178

(JMIR Res Protoc 2023;12:e48178) doi: 10.2196/48178

#### **KEYWORDS**

RenderX

nurse; wearable; wearable device; mHealth; mobile health; health technology adoption and use; health outcome; adoption; usage; health technology; digital health; integrative review; literature review

# Introduction

Globally, nurses constitute the largest body of regulated health care professionals and account for the greatest proportion of direct patient care hours [1-3]. Patient volumes and medical complexity have increased due to organizational factors (eg, understaffing) and population aging, increasing the workload and stress of nurses—these are 2 factors known to negatively influence their overall health, quality of life, and job satisfaction [4-6]. In addition, the physical and psychosocial demands of nursing have resulted in many nurses leaving direct patient care or the profession, increasing the burden of care on an already strained profession [7-9]. The negative consequences on nursing staff are reported to have a spillover effect on patient outcomes, and high-stress environments are known to negatively influence the quality of care by nurses [4,10].

The use of wearable devices is growing among the general public [11]. Wearable devices are small electronic devices that are noninvasive and are attached to a piece of clothing that a person is wearing, worn as a device anchored directly to the body, or attached directly to the skin, and have embedded sensors with wireless mobility (eg, Fitbit tracker and Apple Watch) [12-14]. There is growing interest in the use of wearables in the health care setting to provide data for monitoring and to improve the delivery of care for patients in both outpatient and inpatient settings [15-18].

Another potential application of wearable devices in the health care setting is with the staff providing patient care, including the nursing staff. Some nursing staff are already using wearable devices for personal or work-related reasons, such as physical activity monitoring [19], highlighting the feasibility of collecting wearable data and assessing its utility in informing decision-making about nurses' health. However, efforts to synthesize wearable devices that focus on nurses' health are limited, with previous reviews focused heavily on sleep health [20,21] or those not specific to nursing [22]. Given the increasing popularity of wearables, coupled with the health challenges that nurses are currently facing, conducting a rigorous review of how wearables are being used to assess the health of nurses would provide evidence-based knowledge to inform how to move forward with the use of wearables to address the health of nurses.

Therefore, the primary objective of our integrative review is to synthesize available data concerning the utility of wearable devices for evaluating or improving (or both) the health of nurses. Specifically, we seek to evaluate the frequency of their use and the associations between wearable devices and health outcomes (physical or psychosocial) among nurses. We hypothesize that the current body of literature is suitable for synthesis, though outcomes and devices are heterogeneous.

# Methods

# Overview

We aim to conduct an integrative review synthesizing all data specific to wearable devices and the health of nurses. We used the PRISMA-P (Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses Protocols) checklist to guide the reporting of this protocol [23]. For the final manuscript, we will use the PRISMA (Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses) guidelines to guide the reporting of the review [24].

# **Research Question**

The research question for this review aims to determine how wearable devices are used to evaluate health outcomes among nurses. A PICO (population, intervention, control, and outcomes) format was used to guide this study [25], with the population being nurses, the intervention being wearable devices, the control being usual care, and the outcomes being health outcomes (including physical and psychosocial).

# **Data Sources and Search Strategy**

We searched the following electronic databases from inception until July 2022: PubMed, Embase, CINAHL, Web of Science, IEEE Explore, and AS&T. We consulted an academic-affiliated librarian for the literature search. In addition, we will conduct citation tracking for all eligible studies to highlight articles potentially missed by our search strategy. Textbox 1 displays the specific search and MeSH terms used to identify articles during the search with 2 of the databases. Outcome terms were not included in the search strategy to ensure the search was as inclusive as possible, given the exploratory nature of this review.



Textbox 1. Search Strategy for PubMed and CINAHL.

#### PubMed:

(wearable\* OR "wearable technology" OR "wearable technologies" OR "wearable device" OR "wearable devices" OR "Wearable Electronic Devices" [MeSH] OR "wearable electronic device" OR "wearable electronic devices" OR "Fitness Trackers" [MeSH] OR fitbit\* OR smartwatch\* OR "apple watch" OR garmin OR actigraph\* OR "Actigraphy" [MeSH] OR ("eye-based" AND wearable) OR PolarH10 OR "wearable sensor" OR "wearable sensors" OR (posture AND monitor\*) OR (wearable AND monitor\*) OR "Wearable Electronic Devices" [MeSH] OR "activity tracker" OR "fitness trackers" OR "google glass" OR "Smart Glasses" [MeSH] OR "smart glasses" OR smartglass\* OR (stress AND wearable\*) OR ("blood pressure" AND wearable) OR (sweat AND wearable\*) OR (stress AND monitor\*) OR ("blood pressure" AND sensor\*) OR (sweat AND sensor) OR (stress AND sensor)) AND (Nurse\* OR "Nurses" [MeSH])

#### CINAHL:

(wearable\* OR "wearable technolog\*" OR "wearable device\*" OR fitbit\* OR "apple watch" OR garmin OR actigraph\* OR smartwatch\* OR ("eye-based" AND wearable) OR PolarH10 OR "wearable sensor" OR "wearable sensor" OR (posture AND monitor\*) OR "wearable electronic device\*" OR (wearable AND monitor\*) OR activity tracker\*" OR "fitness tracker\*" OR "google glass" OR "smart glass\*" OR smartglass\* OR (MH "Fitness Trackers") OR (MH "Wearable Sensors") OR (MH "Actigraphy") OR (stress AND wearable\*) OR ("blood pressure" AND wearable\*) OR (sweat AND wearable\*) OR ("blood pressure" AND monitor\*) OR (sweat AND monitor\*) OR (stress AND monitor\*) OR (stress AND monitor) OR ("blood pressure" AND sensor\*) OR (sweat AND sensor\*) OR (stress AND sensor\*) OR (MH "Nurses") )

#### **Study Selection and Screening**

To be included in this review, studies must meet the following four inclusion criteria: (1) nurses must be in the population studied (>80% of the sample), (2) a wearable device must be included (which the nurses have attached to their clothing, worn as a device anchored directly to their body, or attached directly to their skin, and that has embedded sensors with wireless mobility), (3) there must be a health outcome studied, including physical and psychosocial outcomes, and (4) the study has an observational or interventional design (prospective and retrospective). Studies are excluded if they meet 1 or more of the following exclusion criteria: (1) they do not report on health outcomes, (2) they are specific to nursing students, (3) they use wearable devices with patients, (4) they are not published in English, (5) they are protocols, (6) they are reviews, or (7) they are located only in the gray literature. Titles and abstracts were imported into Covidence software, where citations will be screened and duplicates removed. Title, abstract, and full-text screening will be conducted independently and in duplicate by 4 reviewers. Cohen  $\kappa$  statistics will be reported to evaluate the interreviewer agreement at different stages. Inclusion and exclusion criteria guide the full-text screening. Cases of disagreement between reviewers regarding study inclusion will be resolved through discussion.

### **Data Extraction and Analysis**

Four reviewers will extract data independently and in duplicate. We will collect citation information, study design and location, recruitment data, sample information, wearable device data, outcome data, and biometric cross-reporting data using an author-developed data extraction form (Table 1). Given the nonsystematic nature of this review, statistical pooling of inferential estimates will not be conducted. We will report measures of frequency and central tendency to describe sample and study characteristics.

Table 1. Data extraction form.

Citation information	Study design and location	Recruitment data	Sample information	Wearable device data	Outcome data	Biometric cross-re- porting
First author (year), title	Type of study de- sign, single versus multisite, and type of site	,	Total sample size, gender and age data, and country	Type and use of wearable device and measures used in reporting	Primary and sec- ondary health out- comes, assessment time points, and key findings	Reporting of bio- metric wearable sensor data with nurse activities

# Results

RenderX

Search strategies were developed, and data were extracted from 6 databases in July 2022. After the removal of duplicates, we collected 8603 studies for title and abstract screening. Three independent reviewers conducted the title and abstract review, and after resolving conflicts, there were 277 full-text articles to review. The initial title and abstract review had an overall agreement value of 95.7%, resulting in a moderate Cohen  $\kappa$  of 0.43 for interrater reliability [26]. After the full-text articles are reviewed independently for study eligibility by 4 reviewers, data will be extracted. Additional data may be located after we

check the eligible article references. All extracted data will be reported using narrative and tabular formats. We will organize the reported data in accordance with 4 key factors: the type of wearable devices, the wearable measures reported, the health outcomes reported, and the methodology used. Considering the size and depth of this review, we will not report on the feasibility or acceptance of wearable devices in nursing. Results are expected to be available in the fall of 2023.

# Discussion

This integrative review aims to carefully examine studies available in the global literature that have used wearable devices

to improve health among nurses. The goal is to evaluate and inform on the measurement of health outcomes obtained via wearable devices among nurses. These studies will include the results of both descriptive and correlational and interventional studies that tested a wearable device to assess the effect on the nurses' health. Given the importance of physical and psychological health for nurses, we are examining both facets of health. Synthesized results from this review will inform multiple stakeholders, including the nursing workforce, health system administrators, wearable device developers, health insurance companies, policy makers, and mobile health researchers.

As wearable devices continue to evolve rapidly and improve, becoming easier to use while providing richer data sources, it is pertinent that nursing and those supporting their health consider its use and value [27,28]. Using wearable devices for assessing, informing, and providing the information needed to develop healthier behaviors should positively impact the nurses' health and well-being. This should consequently positively affect health care systems that employ nurses, especially in light of nursing labor shortages. Further, the downstream impact of healthy nurses can improve the care and outcomes of the patients they care for in inpatient, outpatient, and community settings.

This work can inform existing movements focused on improving nurses' health; for example, *Healthy Nurse, Healthy Nation*, a program designed by the American Nurses Association Enterprise [29]. The overarching goal of this program, which has existed in the United States since 2017, is to improve nurses' health in the nation. The 6 domains they focus on are activity, rest, nutrition, quality of life, mental health, and safety.

Longitudinal data have been collected on hospital workers, including nurses, where several of these domains have been studied, including collecting data on physical and mental health markers, demonstrating how data can be collected over time in nurses [30]. In addition, several domains, including physical activity and rest, have been studied with nurse shift workers using commercially available sensors, where they found poorer health outcomes in night shift nurses [31]. For the safety domain, wearable devices are already known to assess these areas with other populations (eg, military and construction workers) [32,33].

Using biometric screening and tracking of occupational activities performed by the nurse provides an opportunity to assess which activities may contribute to poor physical outcomes for the nurse [34]. In addition, predictive analytics can provide context for mitigating those occupational activities that put nurses at risk for adverse health consequences [27]. However, obtaining data from biometric monitoring devices is a field that continues to evolve, and methodological specificities of tools used to obtain biometric data must be carefully reported [35].

Nurses comprise over half of the global health care workforce, and the nursing care they provide is critical for the global population's health [3]. Understanding existing work that has been done to date with the use of wearable devices and focused on nurses' health has the potential to inform how to improve the health of the nursing workforce. This integrative review will provide synthesized data to inform nurses and other stakeholders about the extent of wearable work done with nurses and provide direction for future research.

# Acknowledgments

The research team thanks Jessica Sender, MA, MLS, for her assistance with the literature search.

# **Data Availability**

The research team will make available all synthesized data within the text of the manuscript or supplemental files. The data used will already be published and available.

# **Conflicts of Interest**

None declared.

# References

RenderX

- 1. Nursing Fact Sheet. American Association of Colleges of Nursing. URL: <u>https://www.aacnnursing.org/news-Information/</u> <u>fact-sheets/nursing-fact-sheet</u> [accessed 2023-04-07]
- 2. Butler R, Monsalve M, Thomas GW, Herman T, Segre AM, Polgreen PM, et al. Estimating time physicians and other health care workers spend with patients in an intensive care unit using a sensor network. Am J Med 2018 Aug;131(8):972.e9-972.e15 [doi: 10.1016/j.amjmed.2018.03.015] [Medline: 29649458]
- 3. Nursing and midwifery. World Health Organization. URL: <u>https://www.who.int/health-topics/nursing#tab=tab\_2</u> [accessed 2023-04-07]
- 4. Aiken LH, Sermeus W, Van den Heede K, Sloane DM, Busse R, McKee M, et al. Patient safety, satisfaction, and quality of hospital care: cross sectional surveys of nurses and patients in 12 countries in Europe and the United States. BMJ 2012 Mar 20;344:e1717 [FREE Full text] [doi: 10.1136/bmj.e1717] [Medline: 22434089]
- 5. Roberts RK, Grubb PL. The consequences of nursing stress and need for integrated solutions. Rehabil Nurs 2014;39(2):62-69 [FREE Full text] [doi: 10.1002/rnj.97] [Medline: 23696492]

- Babapour A, Gahassab-Mozaffari N, Fathnezhad-Kazemi A. Nurses' job stress and its impact on quality of life and caring behaviors: a cross-sectional study. BMC Nurs 2022 Mar 31;21(1):75 [FREE Full text] [doi: 10.1186/s12912-022-00852-y] [Medline: 35361204]
- 7. Nursing Shortage Fact Sheet. American Association of Colleges of Nursing. URL: <u>https://www.aacnnursing.org/news-information/fact-sheets/nursing-shortage</u> [accessed 2023-04-07]
- 8. Skillman D, Toms R. Factors influencing nurse intent to leave acute care hospitals: a systematic literature review. J Nurs Adm 2022 Dec 01;52(12):640-645 [doi: 10.1097/NNA.00000000001225] [Medline: 36409256]
- 9. Ulupinar F, Erden Y. Intention to leave among nurses during the COVID-19 outbreak: a rapid systematic review and Meta-Analysis. J Clin Nurs 2022 Nov 27 [doi: <u>10.1111/jocn.16588</u>] [Medline: <u>36435976</u>]
- Garcia, Abreu, Ramos, Castro, Smiderle, Santos, Bezerra. Influence of burnout on patient safety: systematic review and meta-analysis. Medicina (Kaunas) 2019 Aug 30;55(9):553 [FREE Full text] [doi: 10.3390/medicina55090553] [Medline: 31480365]
- Chandrasekaran R, Katthula V, Moustakas E. Patterns of use and key predictors for the use of wearable health care devices by US adults: insights from a national survey. J Med Internet Res 2020 Oct 16;22(10):e22443 [FREE Full text] [doi: 10.2196/22443] [Medline: <u>33064083</u>]
- 12. Lu L, Zhang J, Xie Y, Gao F, Xu S, Wu X, et al. Wearable health devices in health care: narrative systematic review. JMIR Mhealth Uhealth 2020 Nov 09;8(11):e18907 [FREE Full text] [doi: 10.2196/18907] [Medline: 33164904]
- Kang HS, Exworthy M. Wearing the future-wearables to empower users to take greater responsibility for their health and care: scoping review. JMIR Mhealth Uhealth 2022 Jul 13;10(7):e35684 [FREE Full text] [doi: 10.2196/35684] [Medline: 35830222]
- Loncar-Turukalo T, Zdravevski E, Machado da Silva J, Chouvarda I, Trajkovik V. Literature on wearable technology for connected health: scoping review of research trends, advances, and barriers. J Med Internet Res 2019 Sep 05;21(9):e14017 [FREE Full text] [doi: 10.2196/14017] [Medline: 31489843]
- Smuck M, Odonkor CA, Wilt JK, Schmidt N, Swiernik MA. The emerging clinical role of wearables: factors for successful implementation in healthcare. NPJ Digit Med 2021 Mar 10;4(1):45 [FREE Full text] [doi: 10.1038/s41746-021-00418-3] [Medline: <u>33692479</u>]
- Mattison G, Canfell O, Forrester D, Dobbins C, Smith D, Töyräs J, et al. The influence of wearables on health care outcomes in chronic disease: systematic review. J Med Internet Res 2022 Jul 01;24(7):e36690 [FREE Full text] [doi: 10.2196/36690] [Medline: 35776492]
- 17. Wu M, Luo J. Wearable technology applications in healthcare: A literature review. Online J Nurs Inform 2019;23(3):A
- Dinh-Le C, Chuang R, Chokshi S, Mann D. Wearable health technology and electronic health record integration: scoping review and future directions. JMIR Mhealth Uhealth 2019 Sep 11;7(9):e12861 [FREE Full text] [doi: 10.2196/12861] [Medline: 31512582]
- 19. Vogels EA. About one-in-five Americans use a smart watch or fitness tracker. Pew Research Center. URL: <u>https://www.pewresearch.org/fact-tank/2020/01/09/about-one-in-five-americans-use-a-smart-watch-or-fitness-tracker/</u> [accessed 2022-11-16]
- 20. Kang J, Noh W, Lee Y. Sleep quality among shift-work nurses: a systematic review and meta-analysis. Appl Nurs Res 2020 Apr;52:151227 [doi: 10.1016/j.apnr.2019.151227] [Medline: 31902652]
- 21. Ferini-Strambi L, Zucconi M, Casoni F, Salsone M. COVID-19 and sleep in medical staff: reflections, clinical evidences, and perspectives. Curr Treat Options Neurol 2020;22(10):29 [FREE Full text] [doi: 10.1007/s11940-020-00642-4] [Medline: 32834711]
- 22. Waters TR, Dick RB. Evidence of health risks associated with prolonged standing at work and intervention effectiveness. Rehabil Nurs 2015;40(3):148-165 [FREE Full text] [doi: 10.1002/rnj.166] [Medline: 25041875]
- 23. Moher D, Shamseer L, Clarke M, Ghersi D, Liberati A, Petticrew M, PRISMA-P Group. Preferred reporting items for systematic review and meta-analysis protocols (PRISMA-P) 2015 statement. Syst Rev 2015 Jan 01;4(1):1 [FREE Full text] [doi: 10.1186/2046-4053-4-1] [Medline: 25554246]
- 24. Moher D, Liberati A, Tetzlaff J, Altman DG, PRISMA Group. Preferred reporting items for systematic reviews and meta-analyses: the PRISMA Statement. Open Med 2009;3(3):e123-e130 [FREE Full text] [Medline: 21603045]
- 25. Melnyk B, Fineout-Overholt E. Evidence-based practice in nursing and healthcare (3rd edition). Philadelphia, PA: Wolters Kluwer; 2015:1-4511
- 26. McGinn T, Guyatt G, Cook R, Korenstein D, Meade M. Measuring agreement beyond chance. In: Guyatt G, Rennie D, Meade MO, Cook DJ, editors. Users' guides to the medical literature: A manual for evidence-based clinical practice (3rd edition). New York, NY: McGraw Hill; 2015:A
- 27. Patel V, Chesmore A, Legner CM, Pandey S. Trends in workplace wearable technologies and connected worker solutions for next generation occupational safety, health, and productivity. Adv Intell Syst 2021 Sep 23;4(1):2100099 [doi: 10.1002/aisy.202100099]
- 28. Lee J, Kim D, Ryoo H, Shin B. Sustainable wearables: wearable technology for enhancing the quality of human life. Sustainability 2016 May 11;8(5):466 [doi: 10.3390/su8050466]
- 29. Healthy Nurse Healthy Nation. ANA Enterprise. URL: <u>https://www.healthynursehealthynation.org/</u> [accessed 2023-04-07]

RenderX

- Mundnich K, Booth BM, L'Hommedieu M, Feng T, Girault B, L'Hommedieu J, et al. TILES-2018, a longitudinal physiologic and behavioral data set of hospital workers. Sci Data 2020 Oct 16;7(1):354 [FREE Full text] [doi: 10.1038/s41597-020-00655-3] [Medline: 33067468]
- Feng T, Booth BM, Baldwin-Rodríguez B, Osorno F, Narayanan S. A multimodal analysis of physical activity, sleep, and work shift in nurses with wearable sensor data. Sci Rep 2021 Apr 22;11(1):8693 [FREE Full text] [doi: 10.1038/s41598-021-87029-w] [Medline: <u>33888731</u>]
- 32. Hinde K, White G, Armstrong N. Wearable devices suitable for monitoring twenty four hour heart rate variability in military populations. Sensors (Basel) 2021 Feb 04;21(4) [FREE Full text] [doi: 10.3390/s21041061] [Medline: 33557190]
- 33. Ahn CR, Lee S, Sun C, Jebelli H, Yang K, Choi B. Wearable sensing technology applications in construction safety and health. J Constr Eng Manage 2019 Nov;145(11) [doi: 10.1061/(asce)co.1943-7862.0001708]
- Soler RE, Leeks KD, Razi S, Hopkins DP, Griffith M, Aten A, Task Force on Community Preventive Services. A systematic review of selected interventions for worksite health promotion. The assessment of health risks with feedback. Am J Prev Med 2010 Feb;38(2 Suppl):S237-S262 [doi: 10.1016/j.amepre.2009.10.030] [Medline: 20117610]
- Graña Possamai C, Ravaud P, Ghosn L, Tran V. Use of wearable biometric monitoring devices to measure outcomes in randomized clinical trials: a methodological systematic review. BMC Med 2020 Nov 06;18(1):310 [FREE Full text] [doi: 10.1186/s12916-020-01773-w] [Medline: 33153462]

# Abbreviations

PICO: population, intervention, control, and outcomesPRISMA: Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-AnalysesPRISMA-P: Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses Protocols

Edited by A Mavragani; submitted 16.04.23; peer-reviewed by T Feng, J Allan; comments to author 08.05.23; revised version received 29.05.23; accepted 01.06.23; published 21.07.23

Please cite as:

Buchholz SW, Mowbray FI, Allman G, Verboncoeur JP, Beam L, Small L Wearable Devices and Nurses' Health: Protocol for an Integrative Review JMIR Res Protoc 2023;12:e48178 URL: https://www.researchprotocols.org/2023/1/e48178 doi: <u>10.2196/48178</u> PMID:

©Susan W Buchholz, Fabrice I Mowbray, Gabrielle Allman, John P Verboncoeur, Lauren Beam, Leigh Small. Originally published in JMIR Research Protocols (https://www.researchprotocols.org), 21.07.2023. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/), which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work, first published in JMIR Research Protocols, is properly cited. The complete bibliographic information, a link to the original publication on https://www.researchprotocols.org, as well as this copyright and license information must be included.

